

**CITY OF PLATTSBURGH  
PLANNING BOARD MEETING MINUTES  
APRIL 28, 2014**

Chairman Rotella called the City of Plattsburgh Planning Board Meeting to order at 7:03 PM

**PRESENT:** Joseph Rotella  
Karen Ricketson  
Craig Worley  
Bill Ferris  
Jim Abdallah  
Curt Gervich  
Gerald Hofmaister

**ALSO PRESENT:** Kevin Farrington, P.E., City Engineer

**ABSENT:** Mark Tiffer (Alt.)

PB#2014-08 James Moser, Moser Engineering  
Bishop Don Ray

PB#2014-10 Evan Bracy

**First Item on the Agenda: was the approval the February 24, 2014 Planning Board Minutes.**

Mr. Worley said he was not here for the March meeting and requested deleting him in the March minutes as being present.

*By Mr. Ferris,  
Seconded by Mr. Worley,*

*All in favor: 7*

***Motion:***

*To Approve the March 24, 2014 Planning Board Minutes*

*By Mr. Ferris,  
Seconded by Mr. Abdallah*

*All in Favor: 7*

[Meter 2:20}

**Third Item on the Agenda: PB# 2014-08: 83 Oak Street.**

A. Short Form SEQR.

B. **SITE PLAN REVIEW:** Review church new addition and site renovations.  
**APPLICANT:** New Jerusalem Baptist Church. **PLAN PREPARER:** Moser Engineering

For the purpose of this meeting, the below 5 drawings were prepared by Moser Engineering, 73 Bugby Road, Chazy, NY 12921 and titled:

- "Site Plan for New Jerusalem Baptist Church Building Addition & Site Renovations," 83 Oak Street, Plattsburgh, NY 12901, Drawing C1 dated 10-25-13; Revised 1-9-14, 2-5-14, 4-10-14, Project 13-41.
- "Grading Plan for New Jerusalem Baptist Church Building Addition & Site Renovations," 83 Oak Street, Plattsburgh, NY 12901, Drawing C2 dated 10-25-13; Project 13-41
- "Lighting, Utility & Landscape Plan, New Jerusalem Baptist Church Building Addition & Site Renovations," 83 Oak Street, Plattsburgh, NY 12901, Drawing C3 dated 10-25-13, Project 13-41.
- "Elevation Views for New Jerusalem Baptist Church Building Addition & Site Renovations," 83 Oak Street, Plattsburgh, NY 12901, Drawing E1 dated 3-13-14; Project 13-41
- "1<sup>st</sup> Floor Plan for New Jerusalem Baptist Church Building Addition & Site Renovations," 83 Oak Street, Plattsburgh, NY 12901, Drawing A1 dated 3-13-14;
- "2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Plan for New Jerusalem Baptist Church Building Addition & Site Renovations," 83 Oak Street, Plattsburgh, NY 12901, Drawing A2 dated 3-13-14, Project 13-41;

Mr. Moser: I'm James Moser from Moser Engineering. I received the letter from the last meeting on March 31<sup>st</sup> indicating what the Board would like to see revised.

Setback lines are now shown on the plan.

The Lighting, Utility and Landscaping plan (C3) is now included showing where the water/sewer/gas lines are. On that same plan there are locations of the storm drainage structures. One catch basin is at the corner of Oak and Elm. If it overflows it will go through the driveway to the road and the contours go that way. If runoff leaves the site, that's where it would enter the City system.

Contours were added on drawing C2.

We shortened the building up by 5' to get away from the property line. There was concern about the car port and neighboring property so everything was shipped over 5' toward Elm Street to get away from the property line. That detention basin/ditch runs along the back of the property line around the back of the parking lot. The bottom of the ditch is 197 and there is a 200 contour that runs right along the property line and close to the church. They are basically creating a little overflow where the ditch hits the new access drive so if it does exceed the 100 year storm it will come out where the access drive is and flow onto Oak Street.

The Lighting and Landscape plan is shown on Drawing C3. There are 3 light poles in the back. There is a 1-foot candle boundary so all the light will be contained on the property.

Handicap spaces were moved closed to the entrance of the building.

The concrete sidewalks are shown going across the driveways.

To dress up the building, they carried the existing stone across and will try to match.

The applicant added a reverse roof so it's not just a flat roof and has a more decorative look.

The garbage bins will be located on the parking lot side of the building.

The width of the drive-thru lane was reduced down to 8' to help them move away from the property line. It will be one-way.

Mr. Rotella: Questioned if the light pole would be 20' high.

Mr. Moser: Said it could be reduced.

Mr. Rotella: Mainly for security.

Bishop Ray: Normally in the summer we may have some evening services.

Mr. Rotella: Can you shorten that?

Mr. Moser: Yes we can. Each 4 corners of the parking lot so light will be contained it on site.

Ms. Ricketson What are you using for the poles – metal/wood on a concrete base?

Mr. Moser: We haven't gotten to that point but will probably some decorative type. I'll leave it up to the church to decide unless the board has some preference.

Mr. Rotella: Something to fit the area and no more than 14 or 15' high.

Mr. Farrington: Yea 14'.

Mr. Abdallah: I think James should be provided the standard detail for the light fixture that the church would like to use along with the light fixture that's appropriate for the height. Please provide that detail on the final plan.

Mr. Moser: The Bishop wants to prevent people from using that as a parking space when at church activities. He is proposing a chain link fence around the back and across the driveway, with a gate structure. It will be locked to prevent people who aren't attending the church.

Mr. Rotella: The fence will go all the way up Elm Street side, across the back to just past the building?

Mr. Moser: Basically yes the western and northern perimeter of the parking lot.

Ms. Ricketson: Will it be a silver chain link fence or any wood?

Bishop: A basic silver chain link fence.

Mr. Curvich: I'm wondering if you could explore other options besides that chain link. The house across the street is a wood picket fence. It's either all hedge or vinyl or wood. Those might be a little more attractive.

Mr. Ferris: You're just worried about cars parking in the parking lot.

Mr. Moser: Yes.

Mr. Abdallah: A proposal for just a gate across the drive instead of a fence that would incorporate the whole corner.

Mr. Worley: There is already a wood fence there at the neighborhoing property.

Mr. Moser: Would that need a variance Kevin if it's just a gate or pole?

Mr. Farrington: I don't think so. Give me a minute to read the code but it might come down to a code interpretation from the code enforcement officer.

Ms. Ricketson: Would it be just a post with a chain hanging between it to stop people from pulling in?

Bishop: First I was looking at a double gate or something just to close it.

Ms. Ricketson: But if you get away from that chain link look with a gate – or if there would be some other solution.

Mr. Ferris: One thing about a regular chain link fence or anything from the ground up – when you have snow – it can be real difficult to open up something like that. It would be tough to plow. Are you worried about walking traffic?  
[Meter 12:29]

Bishop: No.

Mr. Ferris: We were talking about curb cut details. They are not on the plan. They are moving the Elm Street entrance correct.

Mr. Moser: Yes it's shifted.

Mr. Ferris: You're moving it East. Make sure you have all the details on the final plans.

Mr. Moser: The detail can be on the final plans.

Mr. Abdallah: Ultimately we are looking for a curb cut detail, sidewalk detail, basin detail, pavement apron detail.

Mr. Ferris: The sidewalk that goes to the side of the building that used to go around the side – are you getting rid of that?

Mr. Moser: Yes we will be taking that out.

Mr. Ferris: That should also be marked on the final plan.

Mr. Hofmaister: On the C3 site plan, there is a stairwell access but there is no pedestrian access to the bottom of the stairwell. I'm still concerned about pedestrian access down that driveway.

Mr. Moser: We should probably have a sidewalk to run along the side and tie into the parking lot.

Ms. Ricketson: That was a suggestion last meeting.

Mr. Ferris: Good idea. In the winter when you start plowing snow you have to be careful not to plow on top of the sidewalk.

Mr. Abdallah: Looking at the plans would it be more beneficial to look at the stairwell coming off the rear of the building by the sidewalk area. That would eliminate having that whole sidewalk around the corner of the building. It would give direct access from the parking lot to the stairs on the second floor

and then it looks like it would also give you the benefit of eliminating that long hall way on your floor plan.

Mr. Moser: We were going to flip the apartment and move the bathroom and bedroom towards the center. The long hallway is just wasted space. [Explanation by Mr. Moser, Meter 16:16]

Mr. Abdallah: Again it would get rid of that sidewalk all the way around the building - from the parking lot off the handicap spaces.

Mr. Moser: So have the hallway along the western edge of the building around the back of those offices. [Discussion between Mr. Moser and Abdallah about hallway, stairway, direct access, first floor plans and tying into parking lot.]

Mr. Ferris: Asked for clarification on drawings A1 and A2 floor plans.

Mr. Worley: On the elevations drawings, they have no outdoor stair.

Mr. Abdallah: Where ever you put those stairs do you consider those a fully enclosed stairwell with walls all the way around and a door at the bottom.

Mr. Moser: Yes.

Mr. Worley: Questioned the siding.

Mr. Rotella: You have vinyl siding on there. Cement board vs. the vinyl or regular clap board. The cement board is less maintenance. The vinyl - you would never match the color of the church.

Ms. Ricketson: The house next door has an addition on the back and they used the cement board, which blends in a little bit more than vinyl siding does. One of our first comments was it looked like a huge addition sitting there. You've done some changes and that would make a big difference on it. It would try to blend it in with the church more.

Mr. Worley: Questioned the trim on the windows vs. existing.

Mr. Abdallah: In the end I would like to give the applicant the option of bringing in samples. There is many different qualities and level of cement board siding vs. vinyl siding.

Mr. Worley: 4" to 6", textured – untextured. There are a lot of things out there.

Mr. Abdallah: Whatever you think meets the intent of the neighborhood, bring that in to the Board for their consideration.

Ms. Ricketson: Questioned the swale and dry well.

Mr. Farrington: That was a suggestion by Public Works to possibly put in a dry well.

Mr. Moser: Ok.

Mr. Farrington: Also some of your utilities were a little bit off and offered corrections.

Mr. Worley: Asked if they were bringing natural gas into the building.

Mr. Moser: Not at this point. Asked about the dry well.

Mr. Farrington: To provide additional opportunity for infiltration to minimize the frequency or quantity or discharge from the site.

Mr. Ferris Where would you want it?

Mr. Farrington: By the overflow. It seemed like the whole swale has a flat bottom. Is that sloped at all?

Mr. Moser: No. It's basically flat and perk into the existing soil.

Mr. Farrington: Were you going to do anything special with the soils when you build that or just put in top soil?

Mr. Moser: We'll use something with a 5-15 minute perk rate type soil.

Mr. Farrington: Any idea how the soils are there.

Mr. Moser: No I plan on doing a perk test sometime soon.

Mr. Farrington: It's a small site and without being required to do a full Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan I think your employing a good Best Management Practice that could reasonably be expected to mitigate the peak discharge rate and hopefully it will lessen than a peak discharge rate from the site. If you keep doing that and perhaps have the dry well and see what the PERK test reveals. Make sure you're comfortable that it's going to be feasible to get a decent percolation rate and I think that should suffice.

Mr. Rotella: Are you still going to keep the chain link fence across the back?

Mr. Moser: A new chain link fence in? There is a wooden fence there now.

Mr. Rotella: Are you going to leave that?

Mr. Moser: Yes leave that. Basically we want to end up with some type of structure to prevent cars from accessing the entrance. Fence is probably not the proper term any more. It will probably be a gate-type structure.

Mr. Abdallah: Questioned if he was doing a PERK test and testing of the water table.

Mr. Moser: Yes.

Mr. Abdallah: Asked if the church has a pretty dry basement now.

Bishop: Yes.

Mr. Abdallah: Questioned the handicap signage and typical details.

Ms. Ricketson: Questioned the sidewalk on C1. It shows the sidewalk going directly to one of those handicap spots. But the other one is half-way. The sidewalk should access each handicap parking space.

Mr. Ferris: Requested to include the sidewalk to the 2<sup>nd</sup> handicap spot and directly to those stairs so it will be a nice wide walkway. He also questioned where the sidewalk would end.

Mr. Worley: Requested a shrub detail also.

Mr. Abdallah: Questioned where the bathrooms would be.

Mr. Rotella: Reminded him they should be handicap accessible.

**Third item on the agenda was PB# 2014-10: 124 U.S. Oval.**

A. Long Form SEQR.

B. **HISTORIC SITE REVIEW:** Request to replace 36 windows.  
**APPLICANT:** Evan Bracy. **PLAN PREPARER:** Evan Bracy

Mr. Bracy: The primary windows are wood with storm windows that have a metal frame. The basic windows are wood. They will all be replaced with the same style window. There are a few windows that have the grids in them. They will be replaced with grid windows. I want to replace them with vinyl. Currently the color is white. I will be replacing them with an almond color.

Mr. Rotella: Are the other historic buildings white or almond?

Mr. Bracy: I believe they are all off-white. The properties that border me to the South are all part of Oval West HOA and they've replaced a lot of windows, which he thought were all off-white.

Mr. Rotella: I want them to be the same color as your neighbors.



Ms. Bracy: All the trim is off white on all of those buildings.

Mr. Rotella: Have you explored wood windows.

Mr. Bracy: Yes but we want the vinyl product. They are 50% cheaper.

Ms. Ricketson: Questioned what the HOA used for their windows.

Mr. Worley: Thought it was from the Wooden Glass Shop with the same style on both those buildings and those across the street.

Mr. Bracy: All windows will be exact measurements as the existing windows, custom measured.

Mr. Ferris: So basically the windows will match exactly what you have but be newer.

Mr. Bracy: They will be newer and be different color but the white there now is not the original. It doesn't look good and doesn't match. They will be off-white now, which will be truer to the original. Originally they didn't have these kind of storm windows on the outside. The aluminum frame doesn't look good.

Ms. Ricketson: That will eliminate that.

Mr. Rotella: Will the vinyl windows be full screen?

Mr. Bracy: I think some are half-screens. Some windows have grids and some don't. Most will be replaced with gridded windows, exactly the same size.

Mr. Abdallah: Questioned the windows next door – gridded or non-gridded.

[Meter 34:02 – Discussion about the windows with grids, w/o grids, all grids, what's appropriate for this approval, no pictures presented, some grids missing, buildings next door.]

Ms. Ricketson: What were you planning on doing?

Ms. Bracy: To replace the windows as exactly the way it was, which is some grid and some not.

Mr. Bracy: There are just a handful of grids and they are on the top floor windows.

Mr. Ferris: Asked if the applicant has a preference.

Mr. Bracy: I prefer to leave them the way they are.

Mr. Ferris: All the duplexes have grids in the top windows and regular ones in the bottom windows.

Mr. Bracy: That's pretty much what we have.

Ms. Ricketson: If the home owners that were right near them replaced them like they were, that's what you need to do.

Mr. Bracy: We are not part of the HOA but want to look like we're part of it and similar.

Mr. Abdallah: Questioned if they would have full screens.

Mr. Bracy: We're not sure. Maybe on some of them.

Mr. Abdallah: I'm not sure what the neighboring areas have – full screens or not.

Ms. Ricketson: It's much better to be able to slide a ½ screen.

Mr. Abdallah: Questioned the operations of the current windows.

Mr. Bracy: They are old and they stick. They are 25 years old.

Mr. Abdallah: Are you going with fully operable.

Mr. Bracy: They would be fully operable.

*Motion:*

*By Mr. Ferris*

*Seconded by Mr. Worley*

*To make a negative declaration on the SEQR*

*All in favor: 7*

*Opposed: 0*

*Motion passed*

*Motion HSR:*

*By Mr. Ferris,*

*Seconded by Mr. Hofmaister,*

*That the applicants be able to replace with Norandex Extreme Replacement Series windows as per application;  
In almond color to match existing windows in neighborhood;  
To match the windows as related to gridded windows and non-gridded windows in the house;  
The applicant has an option of full, half or no screen for whatever windows they decide they would like screens for.*

*All in Favor: 7  
Opposed: 0  
Motion Passed*

[Meter 41:35: Mr. Farrington explained the Court case documents sent to the Members regarding Hicks vs. Bombardier.

*Motion:*

*To Adjourn:*

*By Mr. Abdallah, seconded by Mr. Ferris*

***Adjourned: 7:50 PM***

For the purpose of this meeting, Denise Nephew, Secretary to the Engineering Department was present at this meeting and transcribed these minutes, which are a true and accurate description of the meeting.

Respectfully Submitted,  
Denise Nephew  
Engineering & Planning Board Secretary